

### **Introduction**

The Education Resources Information Center (ERIC) is an online bibliographic and full-text digital library of education research, including journal articles and non-journal materials. ERIC is a program administered by the National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance (NCEE) of the Institute of Education Sciences (IES) at the U.S. Department of Education (the Department).

### **Mission Statement**

The mission of ERIC is to provide broad access to education research in a user-friendly, timely, and efficient manner. This supports the mission of IES to provide rigorous and relevant evidence on which to ground education practice and policy and to share this information broadly. ERIC provides these services to schools, institutions of higher education, educators (including early childhood educators), parents, administrators, policymakers, researchers, public and private entities (including providers of early childhood services), entities responsible for carrying out technical assistance through the Department, and the general public.

This mission is accomplished through the development and maintenance of a comprehensive, searchable, Internet-based library of bibliographic references and associated full-text, when such text is freely available. ERIC collects and indexes education research materials to enable users to understand and implement education practices, understand and evaluate education policies, and expand knowledge and understanding of education research. The government-sponsored website <http://eric.ed.gov> provides free access to the ERIC digital library.

### **Statement of Purpose**

This document states broad collection goals and defines the standards and criteria required of approved sources and individual materials in the ERIC digital library. The purpose of the selection policy is to provide consistency in the approach to review and select sources and individual items, and clearly communicate process and policy to staff, users, publishers, and individual submitters of material.

### **General Collection Development Goals**

The philosophy of ERIC collection development will implement four overarching goals:

- Assure each approved source is relevant to one or more of the topic areas in the IES authorizing legislation, Section 172(a) 3 of Public Law 107-279, Education Sciences Reform Act of 2002, and is education research. By research, we mean original presentations of education research, such as data and/or empirical analysis; literature reviews or summaries of a field; methodological work; and presentations or critiques of theories; or logic models that can guide practice.
- Increase the number of peer-reviewed, full-text sources in ERIC.
- Increase the number of rigorous and relevant non peer-reviewed, full-text material from sources such as think tanks, institutional repositories, research organizations, state and district research offices, and technical assistance providers. By rigorous, we mean content that has

gone through a review process and presents a method and approach that are reasonable and sound. By relevant, we mean a source and/or its materials must have demonstrable bearing on the field of education and the four centers at IES: National Center for Education Evaluation and Regional Assistance (NCEE), National Center for Education Research (NCER), National Center for Education Statistics (NCES), and National Center for Special Education Research (NCSER).

- Limit the citation-only indexing to those materials that are peer reviewed or are of substantive rigor and relevance.

## Selection Standard and Criteria

As described in this document, the selection standard and criteria are applied at the source and/or the item level to build the ERIC collection going forward. ***No material or bibliographic records previously published in ERIC will be removed as a result of this or future updates to the ERIC selection policy.***

### **Standard: Related to one or more of the topics in the field of education**

All materials indexed in ERIC must meet the selection standard of being directly related to the field of education as described by one or more of the topic areas in the IES authorizing legislation.

This includes information on closing the achievement gap, educational practices that improve academic achievement and promote learning, and topics that were covered by the former ERIC clearinghouses: adult, career, and vocational education; community colleges; assessment and evaluation; higher education; teaching and teacher education; information and technology; counseling and student services; educational management; elementary and early childhood education; reading, English, and communication; science, mathematics, and environmental education; social studies/social science education; rural education and small schools; urban education; disabilities and gifted education; and languages and linguistics.

### **Criteria: Quality**

Materials indexed in ERIC must meet the following quality criteria:

- **Completeness:** The material must be complete, usable as it is presented, contain sufficient content or markings to be understandable (ex: data tables and bibliographies), and in a final form. Working papers and pre-published versions may be accepted, provided they are complete, free of track changes or edits, and are not watermarked as drafts.
- **Integrity:** The material must be acquired for indexing using the method of submission as directed by the publisher, or from an authorized user of the ERIC online submission system.
- **Substantive Merit:** The material must address scope area(s) in a professional and/or definitive way.
- **Utility/Importance:** The material must be relevant to current issues in education and be of interest to the broad education community.
- **Education Research:** Materials are original presentations of education research, such as data and/or empirical analysis; literature reviews or summaries of a field; methodological work; and presentations or critiques of theories; or logic models that can guide practice.

## **Criteria: Peer Review**

ERIC accepts peer-reviewed and non-peer-reviewed material for indexing. The indicator of peer review is assigned to ERIC records if the journal or non-journal content is determined to have been peer reviewed.

### **ERIC recognizes the following types of peer review:**

- *Blind, or Anonymous Peer Review* – Content is reviewed by external reviewers and the author's identity is unknown to the reviewer. A double-blind peer-review process is where both the reviewer and the author remain anonymous throughout the process.
- *Expert Peer Review* – Content is reviewed by internal or external reviewers, and the author's identity may or may not be known to the reviewer.

A peer-review process employing at least two reviewers with scholarly affiliation is preferred. Internal, editorial reviews are not recognized by ERIC as an accepted type of peer review.

### **Sources under agreement:**

To determine if content published by an approved source is peer reviewed, ERIC will research the publisher's website to consider their peer-review policies and processes. If this information is found, the peer-review designation will be automatically assigned to the ERIC records. If not, the publisher may complete an application form documenting their process.

- For journals, the peer-review designation is determined at the journal level and applied to all ERIC records created for the source.
- For non-journal publishers, the peer-review designation may be assigned to ERIC records for all of their content, or to records created for a specific series or type of publication (e.g. conference papers).

### **Content acquired from individuals via the ERIC online submission system:**

A federal grantee or contractor may submit peer-reviewed work supported by federal funding and peer-reviewed. The peer-review may be conducted as part of a journal submission or through an external process for non-journal sources. Contractors and grantees should indicate during submission that the content has been peer reviewed.

Non-grantee content may only be marked as peer reviewed if evidence is provided that the material is from a peer-reviewed source. This may be demonstrated by an explanation of the peer-review process on the front matter of the document. Alternatively, the author may submit a URL to the publisher's page or a PDF outlining the peer-review process.

## **Criteria: Language**

Materials considered for inclusion in ERIC must be written in English or a translation of the full-text must be available in English. English presented in materials must conform to standards of English grammar and understandability for any reader.

For multi-language journals:

- To be reviewed for indexing in ERIC, the full text of 80% of the articles must be available in English.

- If selected for indexing in ERIC, the publisher must regularly provide the full text to verify the language of the content; only articles with full text in English will be indexed.

Material written in a language other than English may be accepted for indexing if it is published by a U.S. federal agency.

### **Criteria: Material Format**

Materials considered for inclusion in ERIC must be made available in electronic format. Material submitted in print format is not accepted.

### **Criteria: Publisher and Editorial Procedures**

Journal sources may also be subject to a review of editorial and publisher policies and processes:

- Adherence to ethical guidelines and fidelity to editorial conventions.
- Communication of policies for the manuscript submission process.
- Transparent procedures for explicit and responsible retractions, as appropriate.
- Scholarly affiliation of review-board members.
- Selectivity, as indicated by acceptance rates for submitted articles.
- Publishes content on a timely basis.
- Free of charges of unethical practices or copyright disputes.

### **Criteria: Sponsorship**

Sources: Preference for inclusion in ERIC is given to a source with sponsorship by a professional society or organization (national or international), or a federal or state government agency.

Also, the following may be considered when evaluating institutions and organizations:

- History of the organization.
- Governance structure, composition, and credentials of the governing body.
- Membership of the organization, in size and credentials.
- Organizational activities and associated review policies for products and services.
- Publication programs and associated editorial policies.

Sponsorship is not considered for individual user submissions.

Political affiliation is not considered during source or material selection.

## **Approved Sources of Material**

Journal and non-journal sources of education-related material are identified, reviewed, and approved for regular indexing in ERIC as outlined below.

### **Collection Advisory Group**

To ensure that the material indexed in ERIC remains rigorous and relevant, members of a Collection Advisory Group (CAG) are engaged to review the selection policy and provide other input, as requested.

### **Source Review and Approval Process**

ERIC periodically reviews the current collection of sources to remove sources that no longer meet the standards and criteria of the Selection Policy and add more journal and/or non-journal sources. This is done to monitor emerging trends and new sources of content. Potential sources are nominated from subject matter experts, users, publishers, or identified as a result of a survey of other databases and the U.S. Department of Education funding.

As needed, ERIC performs a collection analysis to determine:

- Coverage of the ERIC topic areas by the number of currently indexed sources.
- Number of records published during a period of time by type, journal or non-journal, source topic area assignment, and number of records for peer-reviewed material and/or with full text attached.
- Sources that have ceased/closed, or have suspended publication.

Twice a year, in the fall and in the spring, new sources may be considered for inclusion or exclusion. The source review process includes:

1. Reviewing the most current collection analysis.
2. Identifying underserved areas and setting collection goals.
3. Collecting information for currently indexed sources such as the status of education-relatedness, publication and selection history, and cost to acquire and index.
4. Prioritizing additional suggested sources by:
  - a. Reviewing titles and abstracts or full text to determine adherence to the Selection Policy standards and criteria
  - b. Researching peer-review status, publication history, free access to full text, and for journals, the number of libraries subscribing.
5. Input from the collection advisory group may be solicited regarding current sources to continue or discontinue indexing, and other sources to add.
6. Submitting source recommendations to the U.S. Department of Education.
7. Seeking publisher agreements for approved sources; notifying publishers of sources to be discontinued.

### **Inclusion of Materials from Approved Sources**

The publisher of an approved source must hold copyright to the material or be an authorized agent acting on behalf of the copyright holder, and agree to the indexing of the material in ERIC. ERIC indexes material copyrighted by multiple sources when one source grants permission.

Following approval at the source level, the coverage level is determined.

### **Journal Sources**

The coverage of an approved journal source is determined by an examination of three to five current issues during the source review process. A journal may be switched between being comprehensively, selectively, or occasionally indexed at any time. Source coverage is defined as follows:

- **Comprehensively indexed journals** contain an average of 80% or more education-related articles; ERIC creates a bibliographic record for all articles in every acquired issue.
- **Selectively indexed journals** contain an average of 50-79% education-related articles and are critical to topic area coverage; ERIC applies a manual article-by-article selection process and indexes only the articles that conform to the standard and criteria outlined in this document.

- **Occasionally indexed journals** contain an average of 25-49% education-related articles and are determined to be critical to topic area coverage; ERIC applies a manual article-by-article selection process and indexes only the articles that conform to the standard and criteria outlined in this document.

### **Non-journal Sources**

The sources associated with the U.S. Department of Education are indexed comprehensively; all other non-journal sources are indexed selectively.

- Comprehensively indexed non-journal sources include: The Institute of Education Sciences, including its offices: NAEP, NCEE, NCER, NCES, NCSE, the What Works Clearinghouse, the Regional Educational Laboratories, National Forum on Education Statistics, and National Postsecondary Education Cooperative, and others as directed by the NCEE Commissioner or IES Director.
- Selectively indexed non-journal sources include: other federal departments; state, or local agencies; university affiliated programs; policy organizations, research and non-profit organizations, state and district research offices; federal technical assistance providers; professional associations; international or foreign organizations; book publishers; commercial publishers; institutional repositories; and user submissions. ERIC applies a manual document review and selection process, and indexes only the documents that conform to the standard and criteria outlined in this document.

### **Operational Requirements for Approved Sources**

In addition to the above-mentioned standard and criteria, attention is given to operational requirements or priorities and other practical constraints.

- **Agreement:** ERIC will establish an automatically renewable agreement with the publisher or verify that a public use statement is applicable for this use. In addition to granting permission to create an ERIC record, publishers have the option of granting permission to display the full text of the material in ERIC immediately or after a publisher defined embargo.
- **Source Identification:** The source name must be explicitly placed on the content or a statement of ownership must be in the text of the content.
- **Content Delivery:** According to the terms of the agreement, a publisher will put forth reasonable effort to provide or make available newly published content within 30 days of publication via an approved delivery method.
- **Currency:** If a journal source scheduled for more than one issue per year has not published for over 12 months, or a journal source scheduled for one issue per year has not published for over 18 months, it may be deemed a suspended publication. If a non-journal source has not published for over 18 months, it may be deemed a suspended publication.
- **Ongoing Standard and Criteria Requirement:** If the scope of an approved source is found to no longer meet the standard or criteria in this policy, it may be discontinued.

### **Online Submission System**

In addition to the indexing of material published by approved journal or non-journal sources, ERIC accepts for review non-journal materials and journal articles submitted by a user via the ERIC online

submission system. The material must meet the standard of direct relevance to one or more topics of the field of education and the quality criteria, except sponsorship, as described in this document.

### **Individuals eligible to submit materials through the online submission system:**

Content may be submitted by individual authors, including IES grantees and contractors, or an authorized representative of an organization, agency, association, commission, project, a government funded contractor, or other similar group.

All submitters must hold copyright or be an authorized representative, and will be asked to confirm this status during the online submission process. Content with multiple authors is accepted when one author submits the content.

### **Types of materials eligible for online submission:**

- All types of non-journal materials outlined in the “Type of Material” table are eligible; preference is content funded by the Department of Education, professional conference papers or proceedings, reports from credible sources not yet reviewed for selection, and dissertations, theses and practicum papers.
- A journal article is eligible only if it is a result of federal funding or is submitted by the author.

### **Types of materials not accepted through the online submission system:**

- Stand-alone lesson plans; however, a document comparing or analyzing a lesson plan may be submitted
- Web sites, web pages, and blogs
- Subject-matter related content is deemed to not meet the ERIC standard of being education research (i.e., an article on the “Battle of Lexington” or the “Pythagorean Theorem” does not meet the selection policy, but an article on research based practices to teach these topics is eligible for inclusion in ERIC)

### **Unique User Submission Requirements and Features:**

- All submitters using the online submission system retain copyright, but ***must grant ERIC rights to distribute the full text of the submitted material to the public***. The permission to index and display the content, once granted, provides ***perpetual access*** to the content for ERIC users.
- Full text of all pages of a document or article and indicated attachments or tables must be provided; the submitter must provide an abstract.
- Title of the article or document, author(s) name, and date of publication, presentation, or completion must be on the first page.
- If it applies, conference information must also appear on the first page (conference organization, title, location, and dates).
- The quality indicator of peer review is assigned according to the peer-review policy outlined above in Criteria: Peer Review.

Note: Complete submission requirements and guidelines are available on the ERIC website.

### **Selection process for material submitted to the online submission system:**

Every item submitted is manually reviewed by ERIC staff. If the document or article conforms to the selection standards, criteria, and user submission requirements, the content is entered into the

workflow and an ERIC record (labeled with an ED numbered record regardless of type of content) is added to the collection.

## Types of Material

ERIC indexes journal articles, books, and grey literature material meeting the standard and criteria as outlined in this document.

The ERIC grey literature collection originates primarily from selected non-journal sources but may also be submitted by individual users of the ERIC online submission system. The material ranges from information briefs to substantive, rigorously researched and reviewed documents, conference papers, and policy reports.

The following table provides examples of the types of materials considered for inclusion in ERIC.

Definition of grey literature from the 12<sup>th</sup> International Conference on Grey Literature at Prague, December 2010:

*“Grey literature stands for manifold document types produced on all levels of government, academics, business and industry in print and electronic formats that are protected by intellectual property rights, of sufficient quality to be collected and preserved by library holdings or institutional repositories, but not controlled by commercial publishers i.e., where publishing is not the primary activity of the producing body.”*

Type of Material	Brief Description
<i>Bibliographies and literature reviews</i>	Summaries of publications and/or reference information on specific education-related topics.
<i>Books</i>	Fully developed, lengthy publications on a particular education-related topic; <i>Book chapters</i> —Sub-sections of education-related books focused on a particular topic. <i>Serial Monograph</i> — May be an approved source for regular indexing or a single monograph published by an approved book publisher under agreement.
<i>Booklets</i>	Brief publications focused on a particular education-related topic; not marketing materials.
<i>Conference presentations</i>	Collected works, transcripts or summaries of conference proceedings; fully developed research or scholarly papers or posters presented at a conference; and selected conference presentations, including keynote speeches.
<i>Congressional or legislative hearings or reports</i>	Descriptive, evaluative, or technical publications of the United States Congress or state legislatures regarding education-related topics; includes feasibility studies.
<i>Descriptions of model programs</i>	Reports or summaries of instructional, curricular, administrative, school-wide, or systemic-reform programs related to education.
<i>Dissertations/Theses</i>	Ph.D., E.D. or Ed.L.D. are preferred.
<i>Educational finance information</i>	Evaluations, reports, or studies of the financial issues related to educational programs, institutions, systems, or governing bodies.
<i>Educational guides</i>	Education-related study guides; handbooks; resource guides for teachers, administrators, and higher education faculty; curriculum guides; bibliographies; pamphlets; brochures; may be for classroom or non-classroom use.
<i>Electronic publications</i>	Non-print media such as videotapes, audiotapes, CD-ROMs, DVDs, or other electronically recorded or digitized information considered highly relevant to education, only if accompanied with complete descriptive information.
<i>Federal or state agency reports</i>	Descriptive, evaluative, technical, or feasibility reports of public instruction; on topics such as high school dropout rates, high school completion rates, student-teacher ratios, free and reduced-price meal participation, consolidated state performance reports, state or district report cards or progress reports, education personnel and salary summaries, and federal or state educational accomplishments.
<i>Federal, state, or county data profiles</i>	Data profiles or overviews focusing on education and related variables; includes demographic profiles and state or county composite reports.
<i>Federal or state standards, testing, or regulation reports</i>	Descriptive, evaluative, or technical reports on the creation or evaluation of federal or state educational standards, testing, or regulations; includes tests and questionnaires, decision-making guides, educational plans, educational standards, accountability systems or guidelines, and technical manuals for mandatory state tests.
<i>Historical materials</i>	Histories, historical reviews, historical accounts, oral history transcripts, primary historical

Type of Material	Brief Description
	source materials and documentation.
<i>Information analyses</i>	State-of-the-art summaries and trend analyses; this could include evaluative reports if they have a substantive literature review component.
<i>Journal articles</i>	The following types of content often found in journals are not indexed: Editorial; Editor's Note; Letter to the Editor; Introduction to journal issue; Book review (unless comparing several works on same subject); Product review; Table of contents; Conference or news items.
<i>Judicial publications</i>	Court rulings, judicial opinions, and amicus briefs from state or federal legal proceedings on education-related issues; includes policy papers analyzing judicial rulings and historical retrospectives examining the impact of specific rulings on education over time.
<i>Legislative and regulatory publications</i>	Legislation, legislative hearings and testimonies, legislative reports, congressional documents, executive orders, <i>Federal Register</i> pronouncements, state legislature documents, laws, summaries of legislative action, etc. related to education; federal and state regulations and state standards; administrative documents related to school districts.
<i>Numerical/Qualitative Data</i>	Must include an introductory statement, heading, or table headings to make the statistics understandable; document must contain a date of publication or data is clearly dated.
<i>Serial publications</i>	Education-related periodicals such as bulletins, newsletters, and newspaper articles may be indexed. Newsletters must contain at least one substantive article or a collection of shorter articles focused on a single theme.
<i>Policy analyses</i>	Documents that analyze, compare, contrast, or otherwise examine education-related policy.
<i>Policy statements</i>	Briefs, reports, or other documentation that describes the policies of educational programs, institutions, systems, and governing bodies; includes policies for school improvement, accountability, professional development.
<i>Position/opinion papers</i>	Briefs, reports, studies, or other documentation from established research and policy organizations regarding their policies or the educational positions/opinions of educators, researchers, educational programs, institutions, organizations, educational systems, and governing bodies.
<i>Reports</i>	Descriptive, evaluative, and research reports. Original or technical research, studies of empirical results, experimental statistical studies, case studies, surveys, theory testing, systematic scientific investigations, working papers, white papers, proposals for needed research (but not request for proposal solicitations), and meta-analyses or other research syntheses; quantitative and qualitative studies; emphasis is on reports with a formal research design, but informal reports also accepted.
<i>Reference materials</i>	Bibliographies, directories, catalogs, geographic materials, vocabularies, classifications, dictionaries.
<i>Speeches</i>	Such as keynote speeches addressing them theme of a seminar or educational conferences; testimonial or fundraising speeches are not acceptable.

## Types of materials not indexed in ERIC

The ERIC collection will not select stand-alone lesson plans; however, they may be included within a book or a journal article, a curriculum guide, or in a document comparing or analyzing a lesson plan. Other items not collected include web sites, web pages, and blogs. ERIC also does not seek textbooks, student readers, or any material that is purely subject-matter related in content (i.e., what is taught rather than education research or best practices); as such material is deemed to not meet the ERIC standard of being directly related to the field of education.

## Periodic Review of the Selection Policy

Every other year the ERIC Collection Advisory Group will review the ERIC Digital Library Selection Policy and recommend updates or modifications. Following the policy review, a review of currently approved sources may be conducted to determine their continuation, and new sources recommended.

**Preservation Policy**

No material or bibliographic record published in ERIC will be removed as a result of updates to this or any other Selection Policy update. ERIC retains records in perpetuity, and will only delete a record or full text content in exceptional circumstances (e.g., copyright holder validation of plagiarism or social security numbers in the full text).